

# QUESTIONS and ANSWERS

Q&A



Shailos Uteshuvos with  
**RAV AZRIEL AUERBACH**



**RAV ZALMAN NECHEMIAH GOLDBERG**



**RAV YAAKOV HILLEL**

By Rabbi Daniel Travis based on divrei halacha heard from Rav Azriel Auerbach, Rav Zalman Nechemiah Goldberg and Rav Yaakov Hillel. To send questions, email Rabbi Travis at [dytravis613@gmail.com](mailto:dytravis613@gmail.com). The answers given here are the general rule, but each case is unique and must be referred to a posek.

.....

## Are Jews in Chutz La'aretz Obligated to Move to Eretz Yisroel?

The following questions were transcribed from a phone interview of members of Agudas Kedushas Tzion with Rav Zalman Nechemiah Goldberg. Special thanks to R' Yoel Berman for his help preparing this article.

### QUESTION

The turbulence going on in the world today has raised the issue of Eretz Yisroel and the *geulah*. Some people have issues they want to clarify, and we wanted to ask the *rov* some questions regarding these two topics.

### RAV GOLDBERG

I am happy to speak about the *mitzvah* of living in Eretz Yisroel, but as far as *Moshiach* is concerned, it is not possible to give a clear response. I have been saying to many people that the *Rambam* writes that as far as *Moshiach* is concerned, we just don't know what it will be like, because there won't be major differences in the world; a person will look the same after *Moshiach* comes. Also, all the *mitzvos* will stay the same.

Furthermore, in the letter that the *Rambam* wrote to the Jews of Yemen – where someone claimed that he was *Moshiach* – he said: What's the difference? Either way, one must observe all of the *mitzvos* of the Torah. All of the *mitzvos* we are now obligated to fulfill, we will also be obligated in afterwards. *Moshiach* doesn't nullify the *mitzvos*. The same *mitzvos* will apply afterwards, so what is the point of knowing the exact cause that will bring *Moshiach*?

The question is: What will be the order and chronology of the *geulah*? Regarding this, the *Ram-*

*bam* says that he doesn't know, but he does bring many details. That's what I wanted to say in general terms.

### QUESTION

We are a group encouraging those in *chutz la'aretz* to immigrate to Eretz Yisroel. Some people are telling us that this is not proper. What does the *rov* recommend we should tell them?

### RAV GOLDBERG

The question of whether it is proper or not is dependent on a matter that is probably different than what they are telling you.

Regarding the question of whether one needs to come live in Eretz Yisroel or not, on the one hand, we find in the *Gemara* that the people of Bavel would come to Eretz Yisroel to learn Torah, and when they were done learning there, the people of Eretz Yisroel would accompany them only until *Acco*.

Why until *Acco*? Because *Acco* is already close to *chutz la'aretz* and they didn't want to leave Eretz Yisroel to *chutz la'aretz*, for it is forbidden for a resident of Eretz Yisroel to leave to *chutz la'aretz*. So, it explicitly says that it is forbidden to leave. On the other hand, the *Gemara* says this specifically about residents of Eretz Yisroel, implying that residents of *chutz la'aretz* who have come are allowed to return to *chutz la'aretz*.

Besides, there is definitely a *mitzvah* to come live in Eretz Yisroel, so one might ask why it is that the great *gedolim* didn't go to Eretz Yisroel. If there is a *mitzvah* to live in Eretz Yisroel, why didn't they fulfill it? All these questions are well-known.

The answer, as is evident from the *Gemara* in *Mo'ed Koton* (14a), is that it is forbidden to leave to *chutz la'aretz*, but this is not in all cases. If in *chutz la'aretz* one will have *parnossah*, then it is *mutar*. Rabi Yehuda and the *chachomim* are divided on this. Rabi Yehuda holds that it is *mutar* to leave only if one has no *parnossah* at all in Eretz Yisroel, while the *chachomim* say that one is allowed to leave also for *harvo-*

*cha*, an abundant *parnossah*.

For this, one is also allowed to leave to *chutz la'aretz*. That's the *machlokes*, and the *halacha* follows the opinion of the *chachomim*. Therefore, to travel to *chutz la'aretz* for no reason is forbidden, but to go there to get married is *mutar*.

Despite the fact that for *parnossah* it is *mutar*, there is another issue that in *chutz la'aretz* they are influenced by the culture and people living there to do all sorts of *aveiros*.

### QUESTION

These days, people travel from Eretz Yisroel to *chutz la'aretz* for trips or vacation. What does the *rov* say about this?

### RAV GOLDBERG

It is worthwhile to prevent people from doing this if possible. As we mentioned, the *Gemara* in *Moed Koton*, which is *paskened* in *Shuchan Aruch*, rules that going to *chutz la'aretz* for *parnossah* or *harvacha*, is *mutar*.

### QUESTION

Is it desirable to encourage those who live in *chutz la'aretz* to come live in Eretz Yisroel?

### RAV GOLDBERG

According to *halacha*, they must come to Eretz Yisroel, but that is only if the situation allows for coming to Eretz Yisroel. One must know what they will do here. There are people who will have *parnossah* also in Eretz Yisroel. However, if a person will not have *parnossah* here, he is not *chayav* to come. You can't tell someone not to have a livelihood and that he should eat bread and water so he can live in Eretz Yisroel.

There are considerations. There need to be *rabbanim* who will judge the matter and weigh these considerations. The *Chazon Ish* wouldn't give a *brocha* to go to *chutz la'aretz* to people who would go, but that doesn't mean it's forbidden. If the situation is such that he doesn't have

*parnossah* or even an abundant *parnossah*, then it is *mutar* to stay in *chutz la'aretz*.

You shouldn't ask if you are going to bring us closer to *Moshiach* by coming to Eretz Yisroel or that you are going to *chas veshalom* push away *Moshiach* if you don't come. I don't know if it will bring *Moshiach* or not. That's not the issue in the *Gemara*. The question is what circumstances obligate or exempt a person from coming to live in Eretz Yisroel.

Concerning the *mitzvah* of "ve'ahava lerei'acha kamocho" and thus influencing others not to leave the land, the *machlokes* between Rabi Yehuda and the *rabbonon* (*Moed Koton* 14a) is how much a person needs to give up for this *mitzvah* of living there. If we'd assume that one could come to Eretz Yisroel and make a livelihood, he is required to do so.

But it's not always certain that coming to Eretz Yisroel has a good effect if he doesn't have anything here, not a house or an apartment. In our times, buying a house is a great expense and can entail a lifetime of hard work. In every case, one needs to know more details and only then can the question be answered, but without knowing the details, it is difficult to answer.

### QUESTION

But the primary *halacha* is that whoever can come to Eretz Yisroel has a *chiyuv* to do so?

### RAV GOLDBERG

Correct. There is a *mitzvah*, like the *Ramban* says.

.....

The author expresses his gratitude to R' Naftali and Rivki Leshkowitz, who sponsor the *shailos and teshuvos* program of *Kollel Toras Chaim*. For more information about Rabbi Travis's work or to set up a *shiur* during one of his visits, email [dytravis613@gmail.com](mailto:dytravis613@gmail.com). The author thanks his *talmidim*, Rabbi Aryeh Thau, Rabbi Yehuda Korolnik, Rabbi Yonason Harris and Rabbi Yaakov March, for their assistance in preparing this column.

## Trusted.

PROUDLY SERVING THE TRISTATE AREA FOR 23 YEARS

**PUT OUR EXPERIENCE TO WORK FOR YOU.**

- ◆ FIRST TIME HOME BUYERS
- ◆ REFINANCING
- ◆ INVESTMENT PROPERTIES
- ◆ SANDY GRANTS
- ◆ NON-OCCUPYING COSIGNERS
- ◆ COMMERCIAL FINANCING

CORPORATE OFFICE  
777 PASSAIC AVENUE • CLIFTON NJ 07012

**Yitzchok Kamenetsky**

JK@FUNDINGRMC.COM  
P 732.370.5000 C 732.803.7077  
NMLS ID #51030

**FUNDING RESOURCES**  
MORTGAGE CORP.  
LICENSED MORTGAGE BANKERS

LICENSED BY THE NY DEPARTMENT OF FINANCIAL SERVICES & NJ DEPARTMENT OF BANKING AND INSURANCE FRMC NMLS ID #24675.